

## SOURCE SHEET - PURIM SHIUR 2022

# DAY AND NIGHT

[www.rabbidunner.com](http://www.rabbidunner.com)

### 1. WHAT DO CHANUKA AND PURIM REPRESENT

We have two chagim that are not in the Torah – Chanuka and Purim. Both of them are “galut” chagim.

- Purim happened between first and second Beit Hamikdash
- Chanuka happened during a galus in the middle of second Beis Hamikdash

#### According to tradition:

Chanuka relates to Torah Shebaal Peh – because it isn't in Tanach.

Purim is connected to Torah Shebichsav – because it is in Tanach.

### 2. SURELY PURIM IS TORAH SHEBAAL PEH?

Surely Purim is the chag connected to Torah Shebaal Peh? The gemara in Shabbat 88a says that God dangled the mountain, Mount Sinai, over the Jews heads: *Kafu Aleihem Har Kegigis* – like a lid. And he threatened them – either you accept the Torah, or this will be your grave.

“וַיִּתְּצֵבּוּ בְּתַחְתִּית הַהָר” אָמַר רַב אֲבָדִימִי בַר חֲמָא בַר חֲסָא: מִלְּמַד שֶׁכַּפָּה הַקְּדוּשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא עָלֵיהֶם אֶת הָהָר כְּגִיגִית, וְאָמַר לָהֶם: אִם אַתֶּם מְקַבְּלִים הַתּוֹרָה מוּטָב, וְאִם לֹא – שָׁם תִּהְיֶה קְבוּרַתְכֶם. אָמַר רַב אֲחָא בַר יַעֲקֹב: מִכָּאן מוֹדְעָא רַבָּה לְאוֹרֵייתָא. אָמַר רַבָּא: אִף עַל פִּי כֵן הַדּוֹר קִבְּלוּהָ בְיָמֵי אַחַשְׁוֵרוּשׁ, דְּכִתְיִב: “קִיְמוּ וְקִבְּלוּ הַיְהוּדִים” – קִיְמוּ מֵהַ שְׁקִיבְלוּ כְּבָר.

*The Torah says: הָרָה וַיִּתְּצֵבּוּ בְּתַחְתִּית הַהָר “[And Moses brought forth the people out of the camp to meet God]; and they stood at the lowermost part of the mount” (Ex. 19:17). Rabbi Avdimi bar Hama bar Hasa said: the Jewish people actually stood beneath the mountain, and the verse teaches that God dangled the mountain above the Jews like a lid, and said to them: If you accept the Torah, excellent, and if not, here will be your burial. Rav Aha bar Ya’akov said: From here there is a substantial caveat to the obligation to fulfill the Torah. The Jewish people can claim that they were coerced into accepting the Torah, and it is therefore not binding. Rava said: Even so, they accepted it again, [this time] willingly, in the time of Ahasuerus, as it is written: קִיְמוּ וְקִבְּלוּ הַיְהוּדִים “The Jews carried out, and took upon themselves...” (Esther 9:27), and he taught: The Jews carried out what they had already taken upon themselves through coercion at Sinai [this time willingly].*

Even though the Jewish people said *Naaseh Venishma* – their Kabbalat HaTorah at Mount Sinai was lacking in something, because there was an element of compulsion, of being forced – even if in the end they wanted to accept it anyway.

When was the Torah really accepted fully? The gemara says – *Hadar Kibluha Bimey Achasverosh* – they accepted it again in the time of King Achashverosh, because it says in the Megilla – *Kiyemu Vekiblu Hayehudim*.

All the commentaries ask – why did the Jewish people need to be forced, why didn't they accept the Torah willingly? The most famous answer is the idea that the Jewish people willingly accepted Torah Shebichsav – and they said *Naaseh Venishma*, but they were reluctant to accept Torah Shebaal Peh – and so God threatened them, and they accepted it, out of fear of annihilation.

Then, after the miracle of Purim, they willingly accepted what they had previously only accepted reluctantly (Pnei Yehoshua). Which surely means that Purim is most closely associated with Torah Shebaal Peh. So why is Chanuka considered the yomtov of Torah Shebaal Peh and Purim the festival of Torah Shebichsav?

### **3. SEUDAS PURIM IF PURIM FALLS ON SHABBAT**

If Purim falls on Shabbes – which cannot happen in Chutz Laaretz according to our preset 19-year cycle – but it can happen in Yerushalayim where they celebrate Purim on Shushan Purim, which can fall on Shabbes – the megillah can't be read on Shabbos, *shema yaavirenu*, so Krias Hamegilla gets pushed back to Friday.

But what about the seuda? The gemara doesn't discuss this detail, but the Rishonim say you can't do a Seudas Purim on Shabbes – so you push it off until after Shabbes as a "tashlumin" for the seudah you missed on shabbes. That's because the chiyuv of seudah on Shabbes cannot be eclipsed by the chiyuv of seudah on Purim.

But this leaves us with a question: the Gemara says regarding Seudas Purim – you can't do it at night, it has to be in the day. Because all the other mitzvas have to be done in the day (including Megillah) and therefore Seudah also has to be in the day, and if you did it at night it's no good.

But what if you missed the day of Purim, because it was shabbos, and you couldn't do Seudas Purim on Shabbos? Do you have to eat the tashlumin seudah in the day – on Sunday? Or can you eat it in the night – on Motzei Shabbos?

Reb Meir Simcha Hachohen of Dvinsk in the Meshech Chochma says you can eat the seudah on Saturday night, and actually – Saturday night might even be preferable. If you are eating the seudah on Purim, you must eat it in the day. But if you couldn't eat it on Purim, and this is a make-up seudah, the "daytime only" rule doesn't apply, and it makes more sense to eat the seudah at night, and not to push it off until the following day.

But Chasam Sofer (Drashos – Parshas Zachor 1832) says differently. In his opinion the halacha is that you always have to have the Purim seudah during the day, even if it's a day after Purim when Purim is on Shabbos.

In fact, he uses this to learn pshat in the Gemara in Megilla 7b which deals with this very topic:

אָמַר רַבָּא סְעוּדַת פּוּרִים שְׁאַכְלָה בַּלַּיְלָה לֹא יֵצֵא יְדֵי חוּבְתוֹ מֵאֵי טַעְמָא "יָמֵי מְשֻׁתָּה וְשִׁמְחָה" בְּתֵיב

The Gemara relates a story:

רַב אֲשִׁי הָוָה יְתִיב קַמֵּיהּ דְּרַב כְּהֵנָא, נִגְהַ וְלֹא אָתוּ רַבָּנִן. אָמַר לִיהּ מֵאֵי טַעְמָא לֹא אָתוּ רַבָּנִן? דְּלִמָּא טְרִידֵי בְּסְעוּדַת פּוּרִים. אָמַר לִיהּ וְלֹא הָוָה אֶפְשָׁר לְמִיכְלָה בְּאוּרְתָא? אָמַר לִיהּ לֹא שְׁמִיעַ לִיהּ לְמַר הָא דְאָמַר רַבָּא סְעוּדַת פּוּרִים שְׁאַכְלָה בַּלַּיְלָה לֹא יֵצֵא יְדֵי חוּבְתוֹ? אָמַר לִיהּ, אָמַר רַבָּא הֲכִי? אָמַר לִיהּ אִין. תְּנָא מִינֵיהּ אַרְבְּעִין זִימְנִין וְדַמֵּי לִיהּ כְּמֵאן דְּמִנַּח בְּכִיסֵּיהּ

***Rav Ashi was sitting before Rav Kahana his teacher on Purim, and it grew dark and the Sages who usually came to study with him did not come. Rav Ashi said to him: What is the reason that the Sages did not come today? Rav Kahana answered: Perhaps they are preoccupied with the Purim feast. Rav Ashi said to him: Wasn't it possible for them to eat the feast at night on Purim, instead of being derelict in their Torah study on Purim day? Rav Kahana said to him: Didn't the master learn that which Rava said: A Purim feast that one ate at night did not fulfill his obligation? Rav Ashi said to him: Did Rava say that? Rav Kahana said to him: Yes. Rav Ashi then learned it from him forty times until he remembered it so well that it seemed to him as if it were placed in his purse.***

The Gemara implies that Rav Ashi didn't know the halacha that you can't have the seudah in the night, only in the day. The Chasam Sofer says: really – how's that possible? Rav Ashi didn't know the halocho? He'd never heard it before? It makes no sense that Rav Ashi had never heard this halacha before?

The Chasam Sofer explains that the Gemara is not talking about an ordinary Purim, it is talking about a Purim that occurred on Shabbes, and the seudah had to be pushed off. Rav Ashi thought that in such a situation you could have the seudah at night, and you didn't have to wait until the day – so Rav Kahana taught him a new halocho – that Rovov says that even a nidche seudah, a tashlumin seuda, has to be eaten during the day.

We have a difference of opinion between the Meshech Chochma and the Chasam Sofer. Reb Meir Simcha seems to be saying that the main chiyuv for all the mitzvos on Purim is by day, not night. But that only applies if it is actually Purim. If it isn't Purim, and it's just a make-up seuda, who cares if it is in the day or the night? In fact, the sooner you do it the better. Meanwhile, the Chasam Sofer believes that there is a specific requirement for the seudah that it has to be in the day, irrespective of whether it is Purim or not.

#### **4. WHY DOES THE CHASAM SOFER INSIST THAT THE SEUDAH HAS TO BE IN THE DAY?**

Let's look at another drasha of the Chasam Sofer (Purim 1836). The Chasam Sofer brings up the halacha that Seudas Purim on Purim has to be in the day, and that the Beis Yosef says that one mustn't have a meat meal on Purim night so that you don't think that you discharged your "Seudas Purim" duty at night.

The Chasam Sofer then quotes an interesting Chazal: When Moshe Rabbeinu was learning with Hashem on Mount Sinai, how did he know whether it was day or night? According to Chazal, when it was Torah Shebichsav – he knew it was day, and when it was Torah Shebaal Peh – he knew it was night.

Chazal add that the best time for learning Torah Shebichsav is daytime, and the best time for learning Torah Shebaal Peh is nighttime (Pirkei D'Rabbi Eliezer). Rav Menachem ben Binyamin Recanati (13<sup>th</sup> century kabbalist sets it out very clearly:

ודע כי צריך אדם להתעסק בתורה שבכתב ביום ובתורה שבעל פה בלילה

Therefore, because the major aspect of Purim was Kabbolas Hatorah Shebaal Peh, one should eat the seudah specifically at night – which is Torah Shebaal Peh time.

The Chasam Sofer explains that this makes no sense. If that is the thought process, it would amount to a fundamental error. Purim is not just about Torah Shebaal Peh on its own. Because Torah Shebichsav only works with Torah Shebaal Peh.

We eat the seudah during the day to demonstrate that by accepting Torah Shebaal Peh on Purim, not only were we accepting Torah Shebaal Peh, but we were also – finally – accepting Torah Bichsav properly. Because there is no “shleimus” in Torah Shebichsav without Torah Shebaal Peh.

### **5. MAKE-UP SEUDAH ON SUNDAY HAS TO BE DURING THE DAY**

With this chiddush we can understand why the Chasam Sofer was so insistent that even on Sunday after a Shabbes Purim, the seudah has to be during the day, not on Motzei Shabbes. It doesn't have to do with Yom Purim. It has to do with the symbolic connection between Torah Shebichsav and Torah Shebaal Peh -- because the simcha is not just about Torah Shebaal Peh on its own.

There are two reasons why people find it hard to learn Torah Shebaal Peh and why they prefer to read pesukim in the Torah and Tanach. Firstly, it's simpler – there are no hard concepts, no detailed arguments and points of view, no complicated Tosfos, etc. Torah Shebaal Peh requires hard work, and people don't want that level of exertion.

A second reason is this: people don't see why all the details of Torah Shebaal Peh are even relevant to them. In fact, for many people the study of Torah Shebaal Peh has become very similar to the way they learn Torah Shebichsav – they read through it, quickly. And if they find something a little challenging, they skim through it, or skip it and go onto the next piece.

But the reality is totally different – a true Torah life is full of complexities, full of challenges, full of contradictions, and it is never superficial and shallow. And it is these two reasons that are the background to celebrating the miracle of both Chanuka and Purim.

What was the challenge to the Jewish people at the time of Chanukah? *Hitrashlut* – negligence, apathy. The Jewish people were not ready to take risks and they were not ready to put themselves in challenging situations for their Judaism. How did the Chashmonaim change that? By being *moser nefesh* – to counteract the apathy of Jewish life. That is the essence of Torah Shebaal Peh – no pain, no gain. The Chashmonaim brought back the essence of Torah Shebaal Peh.

At the beginning of the Purim story, Jews saw no reason why they couldn't enjoy a festive meal with Achashveirosh and still be good Jews. There was no "law" against it in the Torah. They couldn't understand why Mordechai was so fanatical about it, and generally – Mordechai seemed to go well beyond their superficial understanding of Judaism in his version of Judaism.

But Mordechai was the definition of Torah Shebaal Peh that gives meaning to Torah Shebichsav. After the miracle occurred the Jews suddenly realized that what they thought they knew, they didn't know at all. Their Torah Shebichsav was lacking, it was shallow, and ultimately it was leading them down the wrong path. They were heading towards oblivion. Once the miracle happened, they saw that only Mordechai's way gave Torah Shebichsav any real meaning.

That is the yomtov of Purim – Layehudim Hoysa Orah: Zu Torah.

On Chanuka we celebrate the *mesirus nefesh* of Torah Shebaal Peh.

But on Purim we celebrate Torah Shebichsav, which has no value without proper Torah Shebaal Peh.